

Grade 9 Answer

Interpretation Differences

4/4
Marks

Question:

Study Interpretations 1 and 2. They give different views about the desegregation of schools in USA. What is the main difference between these two views? Explain your answer, using details from both interpretations.
(4 marks)

Answer:

Interpretation 1 gives the view that the Brown v. Board of Education ruling had limited impact, and the decision was 'followed by silence'. This suggests that because there was no immediate action to desegregate schools, many Southern schools could ignore the ruling. In contrast, Interpretation 2 gives the view that the Brown v. Board of Education ruling was extremely influential and was a 'landmark' in American civil rights. This suggests that the desegregation of schools in the USA was successful, and the ruling made it clear that 'separate but equal' was inherently unequal.

Feedback:

This answer would get 4/4 marks because the pupil has identified a difference in the interpretations, giving evidence for this difference, and making an inference based on the evidence.

Source B

Source B: A photograph from 1954 of Nettie Hunt and her daughter Nikie sitting on the steps of the US Supreme Court. The paper reads 'High court bans segregation in public schools'.



Source C

Source C: A speech in the US Senate from 1954 from James Eastland, a white representative from Mississippi

Separation promotes racial harmony. it permits each race to follow its own pursuits, to develop its own culture, its own institution, and its own civilization. Segregation is not discrimination. Segregation is not a badge of racial inferiority. Segregation is desired and supported by the vast majority of the members of both of the races in the South, who dwell side by side under harmonious conditions. It is the law of nature, it is the law of God, that every race has both the right and the duty to perpetuate itself. Free men have the right to send their children to schools of their own choosing, free from government interference.

Interpretation 1

Interpretation 1: C N Trueman "Education and Civil Rights" from historylearningsite.co.uk, 2015. Discussing the Brown v. Board of Education ruling.

The decision in 1954 was followed by silence. No orders had been given for a time in which desegregation should take place. In fact, after the Warren decision, not a lot more came out of the Supreme Court on this issue for the rest of the year. This was enough to encourage some southern politicians to flout the law. Warren had been very keen not to give an immediate schedule for desegregation as he did not want to be seen as bullying the South. He was conscious of the strong belief in state rights in the south and did not want to be seen as using strong arm federal power to impose rulings on states.

[<https://www.historylearningsite.co.uk/the-civil-rights-movement-in-america-1945-to-1968/education-and-civil-rights/>]

Interpretation 2

Interpretation 2: History.com editors 'Brown v. Board of Education', 2009

Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka was a landmark 1954 Supreme Court case in which the justices ruled unanimously that racial segregation of children in public schools was unconstitutional. Brown v. Board of Education was one of the cornerstones of the civil rights movement, and helped establish the precedent that “separate-but-equal” education and other services were not, in fact, equal at all.